Comics Bibliography for the 21st Century

Mike Rhode

Or, how is comics history going to be written in the future, and what will be the rare books?

The state of comics bibliography is... okay. Since I last wrote on this topic, the world of writing about comics has exploded, even as many magazines and websites about comics have disappeared. Over a decade ago, I wrote an article in the e-journal *Transatlantica* on "The State of Comic Art Bibliography" in North America.[1] Most of the basic points I made in that article (reprinted in this issue for referral) are still true, and this article builds on that rather than replacing it. However, developments have meant that some issues that were mentioned in passing, or not mentioned at all, should be more focused on now. Of particular interest are websites, podcasts, and their close associate, videos (especially on YouTube which, practically speaking, is a monopoly that can delete its user's content at any time), digital newsletters (including those of companies which replaced their print catalogs), and most importantly, crowdfunded, and self-published comic books and graphic novels.

Now there is no question that podcasts,[2] videos, and websites are primary sources that should be recorded. The new gray literature[3] of comics is now electronic born-digitally materials and includes email newsletters from creators (which may have a subscription cost, as with Substack or Medium) or publishers (Black Eye, Fantagraphics, Drawn & Quarterly), and social media, such as Facebook, Twitter, Reddit, Instagram, or more. It is absolutely no longer the case that a researcher can go back to a definitive print publication years after the fact. Even traditional print publications can be fugitive--a recent *New York Times* article about Alison Bechdel's comics quoted a bookseller from Washington, DC in the web version, but the bookstore is dropped completely in the print version. Meanwhile, on an average day, you might find up to four articles on comics in *The New York Times*--far more than you would have seen even ten years ago. With the Hollywoodification of comics, the amount of money in related industries has become staggering, and the creators and characters have become known, so professional journalism has followed the stories.

Two popular modes of comics themselves are very fugitive--webcomics and crowdfunded/self-published comics. How many research library collections are actually collecting crowdfunded books of or on comics? My initial suspicion and fear was that almost no libraries are collecting crowdfunded comics, even large institutions known for their collections,

such as the Library of Congress or Michigan State University. I checked this via the worldwide library resource, WorldCat. In addition, I looked at the crowdsourced Grand Comics Database, one of the standard bibliography/indices of comics published throughout the world, to see how many books that were funded by Kickstarter, Indiegogo, Patreon, and Zoop were actually included there. It is my belief that these types of comics will be the true rare books of the future.

However, even regularly published comic books may become hard to find. David Harper interviewed store owners about the state of comic book retail in July 2023,[4] and what he learned is worth quoting:

> Either way, many felt there are just too many comics right now. [Joe] Field [of Concord, California's well-known and long-established Flying Colors Comics] said that with 100 plus "new titles coming in every week," there's no way his "staff of five can recommend" that many. And the problem is, if they don't sell immediately, they're dead when another slate arrives the following week. Combine that with many titles having no clear market and customers lacking the funds to support them even if there was one, and you have a recipe for disaster--or drastically reduced orders, at the very least. Several shops emphasized that there's an increasing number of publishers that simply aren't earning orders anymore, as readership evaporates by the time #2 hits the shelf for many titles, if it existed to begin with. That's especially the case [for] those also available on platforms like Whatnot and Substack. Some shops emphasized that competition from those spaces makes it even more difficult to move associated titles.

When one can go to Academia.edu[5] (a for-profit "academic" site that continually limits its search results in favor of paying customers), and discover either 3,274 articles with "comics" in the title, 7,209 tagged for "comics and graphic novels," or 115,894 articles with the word "comics" in them (as of 7/13/23), how can one research or keep track of all this material? Or even make sense of it, let alone include it in a traditional bibliography? How can a library collect and preserve it and make it available to future researchers? Will AI be part of the solution?[6] I do not know if that will be the case. But I can identify a few areas about which bibliographers and libraries need to pay more attention.

Existing Bibliographies

All three of the online bibliographies listed in 2010 are defunct, for different reasons. The *Comics Scholarship Annotated Bibliographies* project has been abandoned. Michigan State University's *Cartoon Art Collection Index*, created by Randy Scott for use by researchers in the library, probably will not be updated since he has retired, with collection searches defaulting instead to just using the library catalog as would traditionally be done.

The *Comics Research Bibliography* moved from an intermittently updated website to a print and e-book edition, which is available via print-on-demand or the Internet Archive.[7] The publication frequency is expected to now be annual, but daily updates are published on the *ComicsDC* blog. Meanwhile a few other projects have started, including Joachim Trinkwitz's *Bonn Online Bibliography of Comics Research*, *ICAF Comics Studies Bibliography* (2018-) produced annually by Andrew Kunka, *et al.*, and Orrin Scott's *Animation History Bibliography*.[8] The *Indigenous Comics and Graphic Novels: An Annotated Bibliography*[9] exists in a confusing state--it was originally published as a print article, but that article is now being updated annually on the journal's website, thus, leaving the user in a state of flux as to what version they have actually viewed. Of these, Trinkwitz's bibliography of international academic publishing is by far the most comprehensive, existing in a database that includes keyword searches.

An Explosion in Academic Publishing

As of a survey in April 2022,[10] there are fourteen academic book publishers with a specialty or focus on comics, some of which have multiple series. This listing is certainly not comprehensive and does not include monograph publishers, such as Fantagraphics and TwoMorrows, who publish valuable histories and biographies, but not academic works. The first academic press to establish a comics studies line was the University Press of Mississippi in 1989, with McFarland following in 1993. The 2000s saw the other 12 imprints established, with eight of them created in the past decade.

Meanwhile, as popular magazines about comics have disappeared with even the venerable *Comics Journal* reduced to a yearly publication frequency (while continuing its website), academic journals have prospered. A survey for this paper found 21 journals devoted to comics, cartooning, and animation plus two additional popular culture ones, including the long-standing comics-friendly *Journal of Popular Culture*. This is increased from two journals in the 1990s--*INKS: Cartoon and Comic Art Studies*, published by The Ohio State University's Billy Ireland Library from 1994-1997, and then John A. Lent's independent *International Journal of Comic Art*, which began in 1999 and is still running. Neither of these surveys include one-off projects, such as *Biography: An Interdisciplinary Quarterly (44): 2&3: Graphic Medicine* from the University of Hawai'i Press in 2022, or comics scholarship published in other academic journals. Just keeping up with academic publishing could be close to a full-time job.[11]

Webcomics

The cataloging and preservation of webcomics has been an issue for as long as webcomics have existed. As with the early days of film, I'm sure that many strips could be a first or foundational but can no longer be found. There are three projects to preserve webcomics, the Library of Congress' *Webcomics Web Archive*, the British Library's *Web Comic Archive* (mostly only available on-site in London with 67 webcomics sites mostly from 2017, and last updated in June 2022), and the Global Webcomics consortium of which Columbia University is a part.[12] However, the massive growth of webcomics in the past five or six years, led by Korean company WEBTOON (but also including Tapas and other sites optimized for cellphone reading), leads one to wonder how many of those will vanish with only being seen by their author and one or two other people. The idea of a bibliography of web comics is such a daunting project, I cannot see it ever undertaken. When I, along with Megan Halsband (the head of the Library of Congress' webcomic preservation), and Robb Tanner (an early writer about webcomics as Xavier Xerxes), interviewed Sean Kleefeld,[13] who wrote an academic book on webcomics, none of the four of us was particularly confident about truly tracing and preserving the history of webcomics. Tanner provided a list of lost webcomic platforms for this paper:

> 1. Modern Tales (and Serializer.net, Girlamatic, AdventureStrips.com, and Graphic Smash). All started by Joey Manley. Subscription sites--webcomics were selected [by Manley];
> 2. Zuda Comics--which was part of DC Comics;
> 3. Act-i-Vate. Dean Haspiel and a lot of indie artists;[14]
> 4. Wirepop, an early subscription-based online manga publisher;
> 5. Komikwerks--it does seem dead now although Shannon Denton may be using the name for his publishing company.

If you include things like collectives, of course, the list gets a lot longer.[15]

The South Korean platform, WEBTOON, is riding high now, almost becoming a generic term for webcomics, but there is no guarantee that they will not fade, as have many other website aggregators of webcomics. Fortunately, more and more webcomics are being adapted for print, which is generally a more stable medium than electronics. I believe the thousands of new webcomics that appear every year though will militate against any long-term bibliography or index for the form.[16]

Comic books have migrated into being webcomics, as well with Comixology and other companies distributing or publishing them. Presumably, these will need to be cited if they are discussed in a work, but are they being recorded anywhere besides on the sponsoring website? Popular mainstream writer Scott Snyder signed a deal and has already produced eight series for Comixology.[17] Amazon lists 568 results for Comixology Originals[18] as of this writing (7/14/2023), but the GCD has actively decided not to index them.

Some of these will be published as books, but many will not, especially those appearing on Marvel and DC's platforms. During the COVID pandemic, Marvel produced several comics that were online only,[19] and one wonders if they will continue to be available. One of DC's comics has migrated off their platform and onto that of one of their licensees, but what does that mean for long-term preservation?[20] Several institutions have collected COVID comics,[21] but will they save, or even know about these?

Are editorial cartoons webcomics? They are rapidly becoming so as newspapers fire or do not replace their retiring cartoonists. Many of them are syndicated still, after a fashion, by Counterpoint or Cagle, but there are self-syndicated political cartoonists such as Tom Tomorrow, Jen Sorenson, Ruben Bolling, and Clay Jones, who send out regular, mostly weekly, emails, talking about their cartooning and their lives. Jones, in particular, writes incendiary blogs and sends out cartoons on a daily basis. Hopefully he is backing up his website.

And what about journalistic comic strips appearing in either print and online or both? Tony Rose, my new *Bibliography* co-author, asked me about the rationale for including them as he was organizing some citations I had sent to him. My response was ambiguous, reflecting the difficulty in coming up with a set rule for a nascent medium. "I play it by ear. If it's a site like *The Nib* that specializes in them, [we include] only something special like *Charlie Hebdo* commentary. Or if it's an alternative cartoonist with a regular gig in the paper, no. If it's what appears to be a one-off, or an extra special piece, or cartoon journalism, I lean towards yes." *The Washington Post* has been running female-created and centric strips for years, first as part of their *The Lily* newsletter, and now on the *Post*'s website, but labelled as Lifestyle Perspective, not comics.[22] That makes them hard to find, even when one is searching directly on the website, so I include them.

Yahoo Groups and the *Other* Problem of Social Media

Unfortunately, resources that are digital, and have been added to a bibliography may or may not continue to exist. Yahoo groups are the perfect example of this, being a major center for aspects of comics fandoms, including comic strips and older comic books. When Yahoo pulled the plug on it, they deleted all of the archives of information and knowledge that had been traded over the years. The Platinum Age comic list, which discussed books and strips pre-1928, was particularly affected. It was reconstituted as a Google group, but all the searchable archive of information that had been created was essentially lost.[23] A private list devoted to alternative comics in the early days of the Internet, Comix@, was not on any company's system, but still disappeared with the loss of the hosting service. The only remnants of it are

printouts that are uncatalogued at MSU, and the book *Regards From Serbia* (2007) by Aleksandar Zograf, which was compiled from emails the cartoonist sent to the list during the war. Some older repositories remain, especially the rec.arts.comics Usegroup system, which was bought by Google, but there is no guarantee that they will keep it in existence.

The issue of whether to include social media in bibliography is a vexed one these days. Social media has replaced many traditional forms of communication, such as letters, telegrams, photographs, and phone calls, which may have traditionally been used for a biography. The COVID-19 pandemic only accelerated this trend. It is impossible to include everything that appears on social media, of course, but I think that important information, such as a Facebook announcement of the death of a cartoonist, either on his own page,[24] or by a well-known figure, such as Paul Levitz,[25] or a Reddit group chat interview with a cartoonist,[26] or an Instagram video of a cartoonist showing viewers through her studio,[27] are all fair game for the bibliographer, and useful for future researchers. Facebook or Twitter are now probably the major initial sources of information on a death in the field since newspaper obituaries are less common. Most newspapers do not even use their own websites to host obituaries, but, instead, link to an online service, such as Legacy. One should try to save this material locally as well, since none of the sites may be particularly reliable in the future. Twitter's current meltdown is showing that, as did the death of earlier sites, such as Geocities or Live Journal.

Libraries are not particularly set up to ingest any of this type of digital material at the moment, and this is an area that will be fraught for both the bibliographer, library, and the historian of the future.

Blogs, Websites, and Disappearing Resources

Blogs, whether on Blogspot, Tumbler, or any other space, can be a particularly valuable source of resource material. One can substitute the words "podcasts" or "videos"[28] for blog at this point. There is a vast amount of material on or by cartoonists in the three. However, they are almost always hosted by a large corporation, such as Google, and may disappear at a moment's notice, especially if hosting fees are not paid. The Internet Archive crawls and backs up blogs at least, and I strongly believe that blogs (along with podcasts and videos) should be included into a standard comics bibliography. For myself, I list both the publication as a whole, and then individual important items, whether it is an interview, a piece that is not going to appear in print (as seen in exhibit photo essays at the *International Journal of Comic Art*'s blog), audio or video interviews that will not be transcribed for print, a cartoonist's process blog or video post, or something else of

interest. But any of these are at the mercy of a corporate service provider who may change ownership, policies, or something else that affects the electronic publication. For an example of a blog that disappeared because of a corporate decision, I reached out to *Heavy Metal* historian R. M. Rhodes, who explained,

> In 2011, I started reading the complete run of *Heavy Metal* magazine. As part of the project, I scanned twelve pages per issue and posted them, one page per day with commentary, on a Tumblr blog that I created specifically for this purpose. At the time, Tumblr was in its heyday as a place for people to find and share interesting artwork and my blog found a decent audience. In late 2018, Tumblr instituted a ban on pornography, which was a complete reversal of its previous policies. My scanned pages from *Heavy Metal, the Adult Illustrated Fantasy Magazine*, quickly ran afoul of the new policy. In early 2019, I was forced to migrate my entire blog to Wordpress to avoid the Tumblr porn ban and retain the content I'd spent years working on. Ultimately, Tumblr's policy meant that I had to move my content away from my audience if I wanted to protect it for posterity (Email correspondence, July 19, 2023).

Podcasts have been identified as fugitive media with steps needed to preserve them in the book, *Saving New Sounds: Podcast Preservation and Historiography*, edited by Jeremy Wade Morris and Eric Hoyt (University of Michigan Press, 2021), which is free to read online.[29] The editors talk about similar issues of cataloguing and preservation regarding podcasts as I have identified about comics. However, since Morris was interested in a specific medium and not a subject, he was able to automate a process to collect data via RSS feeds in a RAID computer, which is then the backend for the website Podcastre.[30] From there, it is a short step to use a search engine to let people search it. Since we're interested in specific subjects as comics bibliographers, this process would not work for us (except perhaps for webcomics). However, Podcastre reveals the extent of the material available (as of July 27, 2023) with 52,552 hits for "comic books," 31,793 hits for "comic strips," 137,527 hits for "animation,"[31] and 4,347 hits for "cartoon." This also points to the problem of plenty--apparently, an entire bibliography of comic art could be created, just listing podcasts.

Disappearing specialized websites has been a continuous problem and some of the very best are gone now, such as Comic-Con's *The Pulse*.[32] Usually this happens when the founder(s) sell to a corporation.[33] Neither site owner Steve Conley, nor Jen Contino, the main journalist for the site, kept a copy of the website. When I reached out to Contino on social media for this paper, she told me, "Nine years gone lol" (although she had saved some on 3.5" floppies that she can no longer use). So unless the Internet Archives' Wayback Machine preserved the articles, it could all be missing, as the current owners of Comic-Con purged the site after purchasing it, instead of preserving it.[34] In 2014, CBR wiped its message boards (or comments pages), which dated back to the 1990s and had extensive interactions with

and among readers, and, in 2016, deleted its blogs, but retained articles going back to its founding.[35] Sometimes sites do get preserved. Tom Spurgeon's *Comics Reporter* site was archived by the Billy Ireland Library when he passed away. Jerry Bails' *Who's Who of American Comics Books* was adopted by the GCD, but Don Markstein's *Comicopedia* encyclopedia[36] is always on life support and sustained by donations since his death, while R. C. Harvey's family decided to remove the paywall from his site after his demise. People concerned with their project and legacy have occasionally retaken their sites back from corporations which no longer want to run them. Heidi McDonald of *The Beat* and Alan Gardner of *The Daily Cartoonist* both took their sites back into private hands when the corporations that had bought them were no longer willing to fund them. The Library of Congress has a presence in preserving comic sites,[37] both for webcomics and for informational sites, but it is a very tentative presence. The Internet Archive is probably the best for that at the moment, but it is a private charity that could run out of funding at any time. Indeed, a copyright lawsuit is being settled against it as of this writing.

I was recently approached by someone looking for interviews based on citations in the *Comics Research Bibliography*. *The Washington Post*'s online-only "Comics: Meet the Artist"[38] interview chats conducted by Suzanne Tobin have disappeared partially, as their website has been updated. Almost none of the original links work now. A search using Tobin's name will not find the remaining columns, even though she was their comics editor for years. If you can locate them, the *Post* only includes a partial set, missing pre-April 2001 and post-May 2003. The series ran until at least 2008. Fortunately, I had saved some of the interviews and added them to the Internet Archive as PDF files.[39]

The Issue of Mini Comics

One format I would like to dismiss is zines or mini comics. There are multiple major collections of these now,[40] and while individual items may remain rare, there are multiple academic libraries collecting these, including the Library of Congress,[41] Ohio State,[42] Michigan State, Columbia,[43] as well as public libraries, such as that of Baltimore. Gaps will always exist in this type of collection, but some are surprising. *I'm a Cop* (2022), self-published by artist Johnny Damm, is only in three libraries according to WorldCat,[44] while his new *Riot Comics* resides only at Columbia University. Honestly, on a per capita basis, the amount of effort put into collecting and cataloging them is probably not worth the return, as very few people become the next Raina Telgemeier, with researchers possibly interested in seeing what her career development was in her earliest days.[45] I'm not dismissing minicomics as

an art form; I am just noting that librarians are well aware of their existence and have a desire to collect them and list them individually in their online library catalogs (although instead handling them as an archives would with batch storage and descriptions for less-important items would be more cost-effective).

Professor John A. Lent asked me to investigate fanzines. Fanzines from the 1960s through the 1980s are a different case than modern zines,[46] and are much rarer, even though they contain the earliest historical underpinnings of the field of study. About early fanzines, Bud Plant writes, "One has to remember that there were almost no professional publications on comics up to this point. Beginning in the early 1960s, the only way to learn about comics history and artists and to see art by fans or professionals outside of comics themselves, was in fan-produced amateur fanzines."[47] Mark Wheatley has an excellent discussion of how he created his fanzine in the 1960s and 1970s in his upcoming *Nucleus X* relaunch (which fits two of our columns by being Kickstarted and a fanzine). One can get an idea of the difficulty of the physical creation process and the subsequent rarity of fanzines via this short excerpt:

> My mom got permission for me to print *Nucleu*s on her school's mimeograph printing press, as long as I purchased the ink and paper. My mom also lent me her typewriter, an old manual Royal. … Eventually we had a set of pasted together pages, ready to be turned into mimeograph printing plates. And that was a disaster. The resulting printed pages looked like ink soup on paper. … That would have been the end of *Nucleus,* if not for the kind intervention of my neighbor. Mr. Richardson worked for the 3M company. For some reason he had been captivated by my efforts to publish a little magazine. When he heard of the mimeograph disaster, he bent some rules and got a prototype copy machine from 3M and set it up in his garage. He had the machine for just the weekend. So Bill, John and I had 48 hours to print the first issue of *Nucleus*. We were only printing 100 copies. And that seemed likely to be about 90 copies more than we would ever need. But, that first issue had 22 pages. That was 2200 pages that needed printing. And the 3M machine took about 3 minutes to print one page. That works out to over 100 hours. [After 3 weekends] finally the first issue of *Nucleus* was printed! All we had to do was fold every page and then staple each copy! But eventually that first issue was in the hands of fans.… For the third issue of *Nucleus,* my father stepped up to help. My father headed up the bookkeeping department for a local furniture store. He introduced me to the printer that worked with the company. Because of the expense of printing using photo offset, I combined issues three and four for issue 3*4. This was because we had sold subscriptions. And it was the only way to make the economics work. Even so, I was working as a paper delivery boy to raise the money needed to print. Issue 3*4 was printed by Printcraft Press and meeting the owner, Mr. Golden changed my life. Over the summer of 1974 I assembled Nucleus #9. By this time, I was living year-round in Richmond, Virginia. My final words for that issue were: "(Thanks to everyone who) helped *Nucleus* finally reach the goal that I was only half aware of in 1969, when I started work on our first issue.

Wheatley says he and one other person have complete sets, but Karen Green at Columbia got issues 3-9 from him, and he has promised his personal papers and collection to Columbia's library. Also of note, his fanzine appeared in Fredric Wertham's last book, *The World of Fanzines* in 1973. "Wertham subscribed from an ad in RBCC. I knew his name and started writing him."

A WorldCat search of the keyword "fanzine" and subject "comics" brings up 27 results when limited by "1960-1996 + English + Journal, Magazine."[48] Taking out "Journal, Magazine" increases the results to 49, but includes archival collections that have comics fanzines in them. Jerry Bails' and Roy Thomas' *Alter Ego* does not actually turn up with that search though, and when looked for directly, has conflicted records between the 1961 original run and the 1998 relaunch, but up to 11 libraries may hold some of the original run … including issue #2 in the National Library of Australia.[49] In any case, far more fanzines than 27 (or 49) were published in that 35-year period. For our purposes, a look at some of the oldest ones from the 1960s reveals people who became professionals, such as Rich Buckler, George Perez, and Bob Layton, as well as *FOOM,* Marvel's mid-1970s' attempt to co-opt fanzine culture. Fanzines were largely either replaced by the Internet or mutated into zines, but Brian Baynes' *Bubbles* is one of the few modern examples that I know of, starting in Richmond, VA in 2019. WorldCat lists multiple catalog records for *Bubbles*, culminating in what appears to be 11 libraries holding some issues including the usual suspects of MSU, OSU, Columbia, School of Visual Arts, and New York Public Library, and oddly, the Universitat de València (Spain), which has issues 5, 8, and 9. The Poop Sheet Foundation (which may be just an individual named Rick Bradford[50] in Denton, TX) catalogues both minicomics and fanzines and states, "What Is This Site? A virtual archive of mini-comics, fanzines, small press comics, newave (sic) comix and related items. The physical archive, housed at PF headquarters, is being built with personal acquisitions as well as generous donations from supporters. This project is most definitely a work in progress." and "There are 16,035 listings and 21 categories in our website" (as of July 26, 2023). Their coverage is wide-reaching but spotty with many gaps in series titles. It is an impressive project that appears to focus on titles, authors, dates, and cover images.

The E-Newsletter Boom

Electronic newsletters have been a recurring popular method of communication since the first email programs existed. Early examples such as the *Kryptonian Cybernet*[51] (on Superman) were very similar to fanzines, but were often replaced by websites where the content could be online for anyone to see at any time. Since then, newsletters have had ups and downs

in popularity, and are currently up because of Patreon's subscription model for supporting creators and Substack's infusion of capital into the market in 2021-2022, when Substack paid comic book creators to start subscription newsletters.[52] Medium had tried something similar to Substack a few years earlier but could not make it work. Substack and Patreon often have different tiers of access with some material available for free, and then different paid levels, which may include chats with cartoonists, webcomics, print comics, or anything that a cartoonist can conceive of creating. Additionally, each Kickstarter project, successful or not, generates its own email newsletter. Plenty of cartoonists,[53] publishers, stores, and fans, also have free newsletters about their products or interests as well. Any of these may have interesting material, especially on cartoonist's projects and processes, or material for sale from a publisher, or a store, or auction house. Almost all of this type of previously-print gray literature has migrated to electronic emailed versions. A list of over 100 current active lists was compiled for this paper and is available on *IJOCA*'s blog.[54] In late 2017, *The Beat* ran an article on Warren Ellis and Greg Pak's free newsletters,[55] in which they talk about the advantages over social media owned by others, especially Twitter and Facebook. Author Heidi MacDonald quoted Pak,

> But with each passing day, the culture and administration of Twitter seems to get more overwhelmed with negativity and harassment. Something's going to break. And when it does, where does that leave all of the creatives and freelancers who have put so much of their outreach efforts into the site? … Most importantly, I'm building a list that will survive the collapse of any individual social network or internet service. I'm not at all planning to abandon all the other services I use overnight. Any tool that still works is a tool I'm going to use. But there was a point not too long ago when I was concerned with making sure I was pushing people who had subscribed to my email newsletter to follow me on Twitter. Now I'm realizing I got that exactly backward. I'm going to use all of these tools, but I'm going to use them all to grow my email list. Because as long as email endures, this list will endure, and I'll have a way to reach my readers.

Ellis has started at least three versions of email lists or newsletters. He has long been a proponent of the form, starting in the 1990s, as well as creating various message boards. Wikipedia says,

> From 1995 to 1999, he wrote an email list titled, *From the Desk of*, where he wrote about various subjects including the comic industry and his work. *From the Desk of* was collected in two print volumes by Avatar Press. When technical issues forced that list to shut down in 2001, Ellis started a new email list, *Bad Signal*, which was described as "anarchy in your mailbox to brighten up your day." *Bad Signal* was replaced in 2012, two years after its closing, by *Machine Vision*; Ellis ended *Machine Vision*, alongside his relationship with his publisher, Mulholland Books, a year later. Since 2013, Ellis has been writing the weekly email newsletter, *Orbital Operations*, which features work updates and thoughts on books, comics, and current events. As of late

> 2015, *Orbital Operations* had 13,000 subscribers. In 2007, Ellis launched the now-defunct message board, *Whitechapel*, as a companion to his webcomic, *FreakAngels*, though it rapidly evolved into his internet home. [In July 2020] Ellis ended his long-running email newsletter, which he had published under various titles since 1995.

Ellis is so prolific that it is probably impossible to know what material has been preserved and what has been lost, but at least some of it was purged from the Internet because of his being embroiled in the Me2 scandals. Sam Thielman, a journalist about comics, wrote in 2020,

> Ellis's influence can be seen in his message boards: the *Warren Ellis Forum*, *The Engine*, and *Whitechapel*. They were fun places where thousands of artists and writers joined forces to create groundbreaking comics, many of which made their way to television or Hollywood. They were seen as talent pipelines for the biggest studios, including Marvel and DC Comics.

In 2022, Ellis relaunched his current *Orbital Operations,* which is sent out weekly.

Adding to the problem of preserving email newsletters is how technologically dependent it is, much like the Yahoo and email groups addressed earlier. For weekly or monthly newsletters, capturing them as PDFs may be the most practical, while printing them would definitely preserve the content, if not the metadata. Also, many of these have different levels of content for paid levels, and it is as financially unfeasible to subscribe to them all, as it is to buy every comic book published monthly.

Crowdfunded Comics and Graphic Novels ARE a Problem

Crowdfunding is merely financial backing, and not publishing; it is similar to literary subscription models that have existed for centuries. Crowdfunding raises money for a proposed project through an online site, but the creators themselves are responsible for publishing their comic. Therefore, almost all crowdfunded projects are self-published, although a few publishers have used this mechanism to pre-fund a project, or in a rare case, an entire publishing company as Spike Trotman has done with *Iron Circus*. So how many crowdfunded comic books actually exist? I believe it is literally impossible to know and like astronomers viewing extrasolar planets or black holes, we can only deduce from indirect evidence.

I recently purchased a Buster Brown comic from 1906 to scan and then send to MSU which has an incomplete copy. For comparison, let's see how many libraries in WorldCat have that random 117-year-old comic versus a modern comic book/graphic novel series by a respected mainstream cartoonist that was published via crowdfunding. *Buster Brown, his Dog*

Tige and their Jolly Times is in 13 academic libraries including Virginia Commonwealth University, University of Delaware, University of Rochester, Syracuse University, the Strong Museum, OSU, Brown University, MSU, University of Florida, University of Northern Iowa, National Library of Scotland, and University of Cambridge. In contrast, Ron Randall has created and Kickstarted seven graphic novels about his character Trekker, which formerly was published irregularly by Dark Horse from 1987 to 2017, with an eighth currently funding this summer. Of the square-bound books he's self-published with Kickstarter funding,[56] seven could be collected somewhere, but apparently are not. In terms of sales and distribution, self-published graphic novels or comic books probably have more in common with zines, but for graphic novels, there is one unique way to get the word out about one's book; one can buy a review in *Publishers Weekly*. It is advertised as a "paid review" in the end pages of the magazine and is anonymous and considerably longer than their other capsule reviews.

As of July 13, 2023, Kickstarter claimed to have successfully funded 16,312 comics projects[57] (out of 25,293 proposed). Brigid Alverson of *ICv2* looked at the top fifteen 2022 campaigns, and noted some are from large comics publishers,

> Comics were the third largest category on Kickstarter in 2022, and the category experienced its sixth consecutive year of growth with 1,755 launches. Comics also have the highest success rate, with 78% of projects meeting their goals. Many of those projects wind up with traditional publishers after they are funded. Two of this year's top 15, Ava's Demon and The Extra Fabulous Experience, are published by Skybound (see "Skybound to Publish First Hardcover of 'Extra Fabulous' Webcomic") and three were created by BOOM! Studios: The Complete Irredeemable Deluxe Edition Library, The Dark Crystal 40th Anniversary Library, and The Complete Giant Days Library.[58]

Several more are from small comics publishers, including Rocketship's *Let's Play* webcomic collection. Three are from Coffin Comics, which publishes Brian Pulido's *Lady Death.* The first six months of 2023 already had an increased number, with Alverson writing, "A total of 1,171 comics projects made their funding goals, up 13.5 percent from last year. In terms of geographical distribution, 72 percent of comics projects originated in the U.S., alongside 11 percent from Great Britain, 5 percent from Canada, 1.8 percent from Italy, and 1.6 percent from Australia." Of the top five projects are four from mid-size comics publishers BOOM!, Coffin Comics (*Lady Death* again), and Bad Idea.[59] How much money can a pre-existing comics publisher make via Kickstarter? A lot more than if they just produced and sold the graphic novel on its own. Alverson reports,

> BOOM! has chosen to publish the 12-issue series [*The Expanse: Dragon Tooth*], by writer Andy Diggle and artist Rubine, through the regular channels [i.e., comic book stores] and to fund hardcover and softcover collected

> editions, as well as other formats, on Kickstarter. That campaign is the top comics project in Kickstarter so far this year, with total pledges of over $1.4 million.[60]

The number of Kickstarter projects catalogued in WorldCat,[61] and thus in library collections, is disheartening. Actually 174 titles with a total of 1,143 comics or graphic novels are catalogued in WorldCat, but not necessarily held in a library (some searches return a title with zero holdings). Traditional comics collections such as Ohio State and Michigan State have very few entries with 20 split evenly between them. The Library of Congress is worse with five. Columbia, with an activist comic librarian in Karen Green, has more, but she personally buys and then donates the comics.[62] An outlier in the data was the University of Illinois, which is not traditionally known for its comics collection. They had 57 books in WorldCat. I reached out to the library there and found that South Asian Studies & Global Popular Culture librarian Mara Thacker is the person behind collecting them. Thacker kindly shared two articles[63] she wrote about how she convinced the university to let her fund a project of backing Kickstarter comics specifically in underrepresented areas. I would recommend anyone interested in collecting for their library take a close look at them. Thacker and Larsen reported,

> For the 2021-2022 academic year, we backed 123 Kickstarter campaigns. Of these 123 projects, only 7 of the campaigns didn't succeed in reaching their funding goals. …Of these 116 successfully funded projects, 92 have fulfilled their campaigns and claim to have delivered items. … On the other hand, of the 116 successfully funded projects there are 24 projects that have not updated to indicate that they have fulfilled their campaigns.[64]

OSU's McGurk and Robb have also written on the topic, as part of their quest to diversify creators reflected in the holdings of the Billy Ireland Library.[65]

For the purposes of this paper, I did several searches using the keywords "Kickstarter," "comics," or "graphic novels," as well as searches substituting in other comics-friendly crowdfunders, such as Indiegogo, Patreon,[66] and Zoop.[67] I then compiled the data for 366 titles in a spreadsheet which is available to examine on *IJOCA*'s blog.[68] Kickstarter had, by far, the most results, especially when tied with the word comics, although when "Kickstarter and graphic novels not comics" was searched, there were only 10 results--some of which are actually still comics. Zoop, Crowdfundr, Backerkit, and France's KissKissBankBank had no results in WorldCat (although Backerkit has just expanded its focus to compete more with Kickstarter).[69] Indiegogo had five titles with 17 books in a library; Patreon had 36 titles with 38 books in a library. Many of these Patreon hits are for mini-comics, and some are done by important cartoonists, such as Maia Kobabe (currently the U.S.'s most-censored cartoonist) and Liz Prince. However, Prince's seven titles are all for a 2016 monthly journal project and could have been considered one

series and title with seven entries in the library. Karen Green does warn that these searches are only as good as the catalogue record, and the crowdfunding information may not be included by an institution that is doing the first, original catalogue record, since there is no publisher creating one as a normal part of the publishing process.[70]

Spike Trotman's *Iron Circus* was one of the first publishers to use Kickstarter, starting in 2009, while also keeping her books in print. Eventually, she signed a contract with a distributor, Consortium, which enabled her to get them into the larger book ecosystem, and recently, she left Kickstarter in favor of crowdfunding on her own. In a 2021 *Publishers Weekly* interview, Rob Salkowitz wrote,

> Trotman recently wrapped up her 30th Kickstarter campaign, *The Woman in the Woods and Other North American Stories,* a new volume of comics stories by indigenous creators which raised more than $330,000 (the goal was $20,000) in September, marking more than $2 million raised by Trotman through the platform since 2009. But beyond the quantitative success, Trotman has led the way in using crowdfunding as part of a scalable publishing business model that brings unique projects from diverse creators into the mainstream comics and trade book distribution system. … After getting her first few projects funded, Trotman found that Kickstarter offered more than just an infusion of cash. "It's a discovery platform," she explains. "It was good for people who never heard of me. They'd go window shopping on Kickstarter and you had a nice graphic, they'd check you out and maybe back you.[71]

Meanwhile, her model is being followed by a few other small publishers, including Magnetic Press/Neurobellum Productions (often for translated Eurocomics), Pat Shand's Cheeky Comics, Sebastian Girner's Goats Flying Press,[72] Bedside Press, Bird Cage Books in Philadelphia, and Rocketship Entertainment. Rocketship specializes, for the most part, in webcomics, which come with a built-in audience. In my WorldCat searches, large publishers such as IDW, Archie, BOOM!, Dark Horse, and Image all matched a search for "comics" and "Kickstarter" and this will probably be an ongoing trend.

The Grand Comic Database Is Not Keeping Up

As defined on their website, "The Grand Comics Database (GCD) is a nonprofit, internet-based organization of international volunteers dedicated to building an open database covering all printed comics throughout the world."

Statistics for Comics published in United States (July 20, 2023):

5,496 publishers
77,151 series
349,769 issues
155,845 variant issues

228,471 issue indexes
397,749 covers
2,147,885 stories

Various searches[73] were performed and tweaked to generate data which is also available on *IJOCA*'s blog.[74] The most relevant data would be the series level (which has 77,151 comics titles in it), but this search does not work for all crowdfunders. It does work for "Kickstarter" which lists 37 series of comic books funded via Kickstarter. The data probably does not mesh exactly with WorldCat, as there are no overlapping titles. The only large comics publisher represented is Image. Of *Rocket Girl,* the indexer wrote, "Series was a successful kickstarter (https://www.kickstarter.com/projects/1214128832/rocket-girl-comic-book) picked up by Image." "Indiegogo"[75] has no series level results, but has 24 individual issue hits, though five of those are variant covers for *Airboy #51*,[76] and two are for *The Invincible Red Sonja #2*, [77] so 19 actual comic books might be a more realistic number. "Patreon"[78] has nine issues indexed (two appear twice with variant covers) from three countries, and it appears mostly used to fund variant covers. I suspect that is actually an artifact of the type of material the GCD is concerned with indexing, rather than an accurate reflection of cartoonists using Patreon funds to print their comics. From my own collection, Andi Watson's hardcover 2023 book, *Distressed Beeping*, is not in either the GCD or WorldCat yet, but he mentions the Patreon funding on its back cover. As this article was going to press, the longstanding *Overstreet Comic Book Price Guide* issued a call for crowdfunded cartoonists to submit their books for inclusion in the book/database, writing on a sister website, "Crowdfunded comics are absolutely eligible for consideration to be included in *The Overstreet Comic Book Price Guide* and on OverstreetAccess.com. … Most of this same information is also true for small- and medium-sized press who want to submit their comics. If your comic has gone through normal distribution channels, though, we ask that you note cover price(s) and indicate any ratios for variant covers."[79] This is rather ironic as the *Guide* still does not include underground comix as a policy matter.

Proactive Crowdfunding, or Reactive?

Librarian Mara Thacker cares deeply about these issues of collecting crowd-funded comics and provides a clear discussion of her proactive project in her essays.[80] Columbia's Karen Green wrote to me about her collecting problem,

> I've been in conversation with the head of the Ivy+ Library Federation about this recently--the problem of adding Kickstarter books. The library can't pay for them: a) Kickstarter is unlikely to be recognized as a vendor, and b) if I

> back a campaign and want to get reimbursed, I need to submit an expense report within three months of payment and must have the book in hand. Which as you know is pretty much never the case. So every campaign I've backed has been with my own money. And it's not just Kickstarter, there's also Crowdfundr, Zoop, KissKissBankBank, and more…. Being prevented from having the library buy crowdfunded books is essentially a form of censorship, since the creators using crowdfunding are more likely to be BIPOC or LGBTQIA+ than creators published by major houses.

However, my thoughts about collecting crowdfunded comics is that it should be more proactive. The librarian or a bibliographer could reach out during the campaign to say that they are not prepared to fund the campaign but are interested in knowing when the book is actually published and possibly buying a copy at that point. This is not particularly radical as it is the funding mode that *Iron Circus* used (along with contracting with Consortium Book Sales and Distribution) and is starting to be used by mainstream publishers of various sizes, such as Boom, Dark Horse, Magnetic Press, Bird Cage Books, Locust Moon, Clover Press, A Wide Blue World, etc. It requires the same attention to projects that would need to be given to them when deciding to fund them and possibly even a little more, as you would want to do post campaign follow-up, but you are not dealing with vicissitudes of trying to prefund something that does not exist yet. Or trying to buy, catalog, and index something that does exist, but not in any easily discoverable way. Creators should also do more to ensure their revenue stream continues; for example, Hobbes Holluck's Kickstarter project pages for his *Fuzzbuquet* comic book contains a "Buy Now" link to his webstore.[81]

In Conclusion…

Comics bibliography is going to remain a specialized field of interest confined to a relatively few people, mostly academics (including historians, librarians), and comics collectors. The amount of self-published and crowdfunded comics will continue to increase and not be easily tracked or collected. Eventually, we may see a project such as the 20th Century's self-published *American Bibliography* books started by Charles Evans that list all known existing books, pamphlets, and broadsides printed in the United States (or British American colonies prior to Independence) from 1639 through 1819, some 72,000 titles.[82] The profusion of independent publishers at that time has striking parallels with today's world. Podcasts and videos will continue to become a source of primary information, probably more-so than printed interviews. Electronic resources will continue to disappear after being cited in a bibliography with "no copy known to be extant" as *American Bibliography* phrases it. While this paper has largely focused on

the desirability of bibliographic entries for individual objects, one should not forget that archival collections can also be a proper subject for bibliographies, nor ignore the joy of a comprehensive vertical file. Opening a folder up to discover a variety of ephemera that you never would have known existed otherwise--clippings, letters, photographs, sales brochures, exhibit booklets, tear sheets, original art, and whatever else may have been collected on a topic or cartoonist. The archival approach is not as comprehensive as a library one when it comes to bibliography, but it is designed to handle large masses of material especially when it is not practical to list every single piece. Comics themselves will continue to be made, and mutate into unexpected forms of sequential art, and new approaches to collecting, indexing and bibliography will need to be invented in the future. But it should be a lively and interesting future.

Endnotes

[1] Rhode, Michael. 2010. "The State of Comic Art Bibliography in North America." *Transatlantica* (1): <https://journals.openedition.org/transatlantica/4939>. Throughout this article, as in the previous one, I conflate the primary product of comics with their secondary and gray literature, but I do not think you can have a useful bibliography that does not include both.

[2] The Alexander Turnbull Library--National Library of New Zealand captured three individual podcasts, that were found searching "comics" and "Patreon," and added them to WorldCat and their permanent collection.

[3] As I wrote in *Transatlantica,* "Gray literature is printed material that is not easily available by subscription or produced by commercial publishers. Little of this material is collected by libraries, and even less is used by scholars. Examples in the comics field include the *ICv2 Retailers Guide*, the Guide's predecessor, Capital Comics' *Internal Correspondence* and Diamond's monthly *Previews* catalogue, *Dateline* weekly newsletter and monthly *Dialog* magazine. Krause's *Comics & Games Retailer* monthly magazine could probably be added." (Paragraph 16).

[4] Harper, David. 2023. "'It Could Be Better, But It Could Be Worse': Shops Discuss the Often Difficult Year So Far in Comics Retail." *SKTCHD* (July 11): <https://sktchd.com/longform/july-2023-retailer-feature>.

[5] <https://www.academia.edu>.

[6] Bart Beaty wrote to me about his bizarre experiences with AI bibliography on Sept. 11-12, 2023. "[While writing about Archie,] I'm checking to see if I have maybe missed an obvious citation. So I prompted it to give me the most important scholarship on Archie.

Books:

1. **Archie: The Married Life by Michael Uslan**: This book explores the alternate reality storyline where Archie marries both Betty and Veronica, providing insight into the cultural impact of Archie's relationships.
2. **Dissecting Archie: Essays on America's Favorite Teenager edited by Carolyn Cocca**: This collection of essays offers a diverse range of scholarly perspectives on various aspects of Archie Comics, including gender roles, identity, and pop culture.
3. **Teenagers from the Future: Essays on the Legion of Super-Heroes edited by Timothy Callahan and Matt Fraction**: While not exclusively focused on Archie Comics, this book includes an insightful essay by Thomas Inge that discusses the relationship between Archie Comics and the Legion of Super-Heroes.
4. **Comics and the U.S. South edited by Brannon Costello and Qiana Whitted**: This anthology includes an essay by Bart Beaty that examines the role of Archie Comics in shaping popular perceptions of the American South.
5. **Archie Comics: 75 Years of America's Teenagers by Melanie J. E. Wright**: This book provides a historical overview of Archie Comics and its impact on American popular culture.

Articles:

1. **"All-American Fiction: Kenneth Burke and the Role of the Comic Book" by John M. Ulrich**: This article explores how Archie Comics and other comic books can be analyzed through the lens of rhetorical criticism.
2. **"Kitsch's Little Bastard: Archie's Pal Jughead" by Thomas Inge**: In this essay, Inge delves into the character of Jughead and his role as a subversive figure within the Archie Comics universe.
3. **"Girls, Comics, and the Contested Spaces of Girlhood" by Leyla Nahar**: This article examines the representation of girlhood in Archie Comics and how it intersects with issues of gender and identity.
4. **"Bringing the New Frontier Home: Archie Andrews and the American Dream" by Mark Rogers**: Rogers analyzes how Archie Comics engages with the concept of the American Dream, particularly in the context of suburban life.
5. **"The Women of Riverdale: The Female Voice and Popular Culture" by Phyllis M. Japp**: This article explores how female characters in Archie Comics have evolved and how they reflect changing societal norms.

Not only did it not offer me my book, but it did offer me a chapter I haven't written in a book that does exist. Tom Inge is apparently the leading scholar

in this area, and Mark Rogers makes an appearance. Also, the Leyla Nahar one is so probable that I had to look it up to see if it exists (it does not). The Uslan book is real. Cocca[‘s book] does not [exist]. The Callahan book exists (from Sequart). Fraction wrote the foreword, and is not an editor. Tom Inge does not have an essay in it. *Comics and the U.S. South* exists with those editors, I do not have an essay in it. Bizarrely, the last book doesn’t exist, but someone should have written it. The author doesn’t seem to exist. All five articles are made up. Tom and Mark exist. Phyllis Japp exists but does not seem to write about comics. There is a John M. Ulrich who writes on youth culture and Thomas Carlyle, but I don’t see anything by him on Burke. Layla Nahar doesn’t seem to exist. You should note that this was Chat GPT 3.5. They say 4.0 doesn’t make up sources any more, but it is a paid service so I don’t know if that is actually true.”

[7] <https://archive.org/search?query=%22comics+research+bibliography%22>.

[8] <https://www.bobc.uni-bonn.de>; <http://www.internationalcomicartsforum.org/comics-studies-bibliography.html>; <https://cartoonresearch.com/index.php/the-animation-history-bibliography>.

[9] <https://www.utpjournals.press/doi/abs/10.3138/jeunesse.11.1.i>.

[10] https://ijoca.blogspot.com/2022/04/comic-art-academic-monograph-publishers.html>.

[11] Historian Ian Gordon recently suggested ComFor’s Monitor of Publications at <https://www.comicgesellschaft.de/en/category/magazin/publikationen-ressourcen/publication-monitoring> (personal communication July 13, 2023).

[12] <https://www.loc.gov/collections/webcomics-web-archive/about-this-collection>; <https://www.webarchive.org.uk/en/ukwa/collection/1370>; <https://archive-it.org/collections/10181>.

[13] Rhode, Mike. 2020. “Kleefeld on Webcomics--a ComicsDC video interview.” *ComicsDC* (Nov. 11): <http://comicsdc.blogspot.com/2020/11/kleefeld-on-webcomics-comicsdc-video.html>.

[14] <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Act-i-vate>.

[15] Email communication, July 21, 2023. Robb suggests, “Some *ComixTalk* articles with a lot of the collectives mentioned in them: <http://comixtalk.com/march_collectives>; <http://comixtalk.com/collective_lective_what_makes_you_effective>; <http://comixtalk.com/you_will_be_assimilated_brief_overview_webcomic_collectives_bill_duncan>.

[16] My initial editor, Charles Hatfield, asked, “So, what could be done, bibliographically, to at least keep track of webcomic aggregators, secondary sources, hubs, review sites?” Honestly, I have no idea.

[17] Brooke, David. 2023. “Defying genre: Scott Snyder and Rafael Albuquerque talk ‘Duck and Cover’. The eighth ComiXology Original series from Snyder drops this week.” *AIPT* (July 7): <https://aiptcomics.com/2023/07/07/duck-and-cover-scott-snyder-comixology>.

[18]<https://www.amazon.com/s?k=Comixology+Originalsi=comics-anga&crid=284XISTWGZDLO&sprefix=comixology+originals%2Ccomics-manga%2C93&ref=nb_sb_noss_1>.
[19] For example, *Everyday Heroes*, for Pfizer, online at <https://www.marvel.com/ pfizereverydayheroes#open_text-3>.
[20] Rubin, David. nd. *El Superpoder Más Importante* at <https://www.ecccomics.com/comicreader/0001>.
[21] Particularly MSU for comic strips indexed at <https://comics.lib.msu.edu/rri/crri/corona.htm> and Columbia University for comic books.
[22] For example, see Schneider, Kat. 2023. "Our friendship ended years ago. I'm still grieving it. Even without closure, I'm learning to accept that whatever hurt I might still feel is part of the process." *Washington Post* (July 30): <https://www.washingtonpost.com/lifestyle/2023/07/30/our-friendship-ended-years-ago-im-still-grieving-it>.
[23] Except I had downloaded the contents, and during the writing of this paper, was able to get them converted from a propriety database format into a large html file. List members are already using it for research, but the problem of it just residing on individual computers remains.
[24] Carroll, Marti. 2023. "Mourning the death of my brother, Richard Glen Lester II, this week at 71" [aka Joshua Quagmire]. Facebook (June 3): <https://www.facebook.com/marti.carroll.31/posts/q1h5HKHuo98M5UF5DsEhDkS8AEuJkFJKoiPY7vVUtxNtFYQ71AyFLl>.
[25] Levitz, Paul. 2023. ["Sad to report the passing of someone very important to comics in the days the comic shop system was growing up: Mel Thompson, who was the first person to do serious research on how that market worked..."]. Facebook (June 27): <https://www.facebook.com/paul.levitz/posts/RMxhQuPsuYkzmkembFKumEFLGMfpKwf3sQgcqCYrbcfBl>.
[26] Zdarsky, Chip. 2021. "Hi! My name's Chip Zdarsky and I'm the writer of Newburn, The All-Nighter, Daredevil, some Batmans, Devil's Reign, and I write AND draw Public Domain on my Substack! And I write some other stuff probably!!! AMA!!!!". *Reddit Comic Books* (Nov. 3): <https://www.reddit.com/r/comicbooks/comments/qlv9oc/hi_my_names_chip_zdarsky_and_im_the_writer_of>.
[27] Weng, Pixin. 2020. "Weng Pixin's Studio." Drawn & Quarterly (June): <https://www.instagram.com/tv/CAdBnbHn6E_>.
[28] The only person to respond to my query about cataloguing and directly adding digital videos to a comics collection on the Comics Studies Society's Research Librarians Cohort listserv, which The Library of Congress does when they create one by interviewing a cartoonist for example, was OSU's Jenny Robb. Robb wrote, "We cataloged the presentations for the Festival of Cartoon Art when they were taped and we received physical media (i.e., VHS tape, DVD). Here is an example: <https://library.ohio-state.edu/record=b6908667~S7>. We have also digitized them all and they are

preserved on our Digital Collections (DC) platform. Cataloging more recent digital presentations/E-videos in addition to making them available on YouTube, as well as preserving them in our DC, are very good ideas." (Dec. 5, 2023). With all due respect, as this is an overwhelming task, I would argue that traditional library thinking about what constitutes part of a collection is lagging behind what is intellectually desirable and technologically possible.

[29] <https://www.fulcrum.org/concern/monographs/dn39x3465#toc>.

[30] <https://podcastre.org>.

[31] Using this search: <https://podcastre.org/search?search1=animation>.

[32] MacDonald, Heidi. 2010. "Veitch statement on Comicon.com." *The Beat* (Feb. 8): <https://www.comicsbeat.com/veitch-statement-on-comicon-com> ; MacDonald, Heidi. 2015. "Media notes: TRIPWIRE is back; Comicon.com is gone; and Hollywood Heroes debuts." *The Beat* (May 19): <https://www.comicsbeat.com/media-notes-tripwire-is-back-comicon-com-is-gone-and-hollywood-heroes-debuts>.

[33] MacDonald, Heidi. 2023. "End of an Era: Mike Doran leaves Games Radar/Newsarama." *The Beat* (Feb. 2): <https://www.comicsbeat.com/end-of-an-era-mike-doran-leaves-games-radar-newsarama>; MacDonald, Heidi. 2020. "Comics news site Newsarama to become part of GamesRadar+." *The Beat* (June 1): <https://www.comicsbeat.com/comics-news-site-newsarama-to-become-part-of-games-rader>.

[34] Unless the Internet Archives' Wayback Machine captured an article, as it did for this randomly chosen example of an interview for which the CRB had a link--Contino, Jennifer M. 2009. "Revealing Chow's Secret Identity." *Comicon's The Pulse* (Feb. 24): <http://www.comicon.com/ubb/ubbthreads.php?ubb=showflat&Number=537445#Post537445>; archived at <https://web.archive.org/web/20090228215838> <http://www.comicon.com/ubb/ubbthreads.php?ubb=showflat&Number=537445>. This search will find other articles and interviews from the site, but not all pages were captured: <https://web.archive.org/web/20080928081316/http://www.comicon.com/pulse>.

[35] MacDonald, Heidi. 2014. "CBR introduces new zero tolerance message boards--who else will follow suit?" *The Beat* (May 1): <https://www.comicsbeat.com/cbr-introduces-new-zero-tolerance-message-boards-who-else-will-follow-suit>; MacDonald, Heidi. 2016. "CBR.com has new design, rebrand, no blogs," *The Beat* (Aug. 25): <https://www.comicsbeat.com/cbr-com-has-new-design-rebrand-no-blogs>; Lu, Alexander. 2016. "SHAKEUP! Comic Book Resources Acquired by Media Conglomerate Valnet." *The Beat* (April 4): <https://www.comicsbeat.com/shakeup-comic-book-resources-acquired-by-media-conglomerate-valnet>; This link opens a page linking to the first post from 1998 as of Sept. 20, 2023: <https://www.cbr.com/archive/19607>.

[36] <https://www.toonopedia.com>.

[37] <https://www.loc.gov/collections/webcomics-web-archive/about-this-coll

ection/ and https://www.loc.gov/collections/comics-literature-and-criticism-web-archive/about-this-collection>.

[38] <https://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-srv/liveonline/style/comics.htm>.

[39] See <https://archive.org/search?query=creator%3A%22Suzanne+Tobin%22> for this likely technical violation of copyright.

[40] See Barnard's Zines website at <https://zines.barnard.edu/zine-libraries>.

[41] Including the Small Press Expo, Matt Dembicki, Heidi McDonald, and Dean Haspiel collections. See Dembicki, Matt. 2016. "My mini-comics collection now at Library of Congress." *ComicsDC* (Dec. 11): <http://comicsdc.blogspot.com/2016/12/my-mini-comics-collection-now-at.html>; MacDonald, Heidi. 2011. "Haspiel donates minicomics to Library of Congress." *The Beat* (Dec. 9): <https://www.comicsbeat.com/haspiel-donates-minicomics-to-library-of-congress>; <https://www.loc.gov/item/prn-11-157>; <https://www.loc.gov/item/2021688951>.

[42] Dylan Williams Collection and Jay Kennedy Collection--see <https://guides.osu.edu/c.php?g=664857&p=4674061>.

[43] The Karen Green Minicomics Collection at Columbia -- <https://clio.columbia.edu/catalog?q=%22karen+green+minicomics+collection%22&search_field=author&commit=Search> -- has 1,230 minicomics as of July 24, 2023. Mark Nevins, M. K. Reed, and Gary Panter have also donated minicomics and will have collections named for them. Green said about 2,900 comics have been inventoried, but do not all have catalogue records yet. (personal email July 25, 2023).

[44] <https://www.worldcat.org/title/1352458064> and <https://johnnydamm.com>.

[45] Amusingly enough, when I was talking to a librarian with a large collection of uncatalogued minicomics, she brought up the same example of Raina.

[46] Wikidiff says, "Zine is a derived term of fanzine. As nouns the difference between fanzine and zine is that fanzine is a magazine, normally produced by amateurs, intended for people who share a common interest while zine is a low-circulation, non-commercial publication of original or appropriated texts and images, especially one of minority interest." <https://wikidiff.com/fanzine/zine>. See also <https://thecontentauthority.com/blog/fanzine-vs-zine>.

[47] Plant, Bud. 2023. "Remembering Jim Vadeboncoeur Jr.," *TCJ* (July 20): <https://www.tcj.com/remembering-jim-vadeboncoeur-jr>.

[48] <https://www.worldcat.kw%3Afanzine+AND+su%3Acomics&inLanguage=eng&datePublished =1960-1995&itemType=jrnl&itemSubType=jrnl-print>.

[49] <https://catalogue.nla.gov.au/Record/6818042?lookfor=title:(alter%20ego)&offset=1&max=34>.

[50] <https://poopsheetfoundation.com/index.php>. Bill Blackbeard's collection started that way, and eventually took up multiple tractor trailer trucks.

[51] <https://www.supermanhomepage.com/other/other.php?topic=kryptonian-cybernet>.

[52] MacDonald, Heidi. 2021. "Tynion, Hickman, Snyder, Ostertag and more to launch comics on Substack: Substack is giving several prominent comics creators the funds to create new content for their newsletter platform." *The Beat* (Aug. 9): <https://www.comicsbeat.com/tynion-hickman-snyder-ostertag-and-more-to-launch-comics-on-substack>; MacDonald, Heidi. 2022. "Substack announces new projects by Morrison, Vaughan, Randolph, Matsumoto and many more; Also Kelly Thompson, Meredith McClaren, Joanne Starer, Gavin Fullerton, Jen Bartel, Tom King, Elsa Charretier and more." *The Beat* (Jan. 31): <https://www.comicsbeat.com/substack-announces-new-projects-by-morrison-vaughan-randolph-matsumoto-and-many-more>; MacDonald, Heidi. 2022. "What is going on with: Oni Press, Comixology, Substack??? The week's new has left many people asking "wha hoppen?"" *The Beat* (July 1): <https://www.comicsbeat.com/what-is-going-on-with-oni-press-comixology-substack>.

[53] For examples, see Parkin, JK. ND. "The Comic Newsletter Directory." <https://smashpages.net/the-comic-newsletter-directory>; or Peterson, Mike. 2023. "Support Your Local (or Distant) Cartoonist" *Daily Cartoonist* (March 16): <https://www.dailycartoonist.com/index.php/2023/03/16/support-your-local-or-distant-cartoonist>.

[54] <https://ijoca.blogspot.com/p/email-newsletters-including-patreon.html>.

[55] MacDonald, Heidi. 2017. "Greg Pak and Warren Ellis on newsletters and creators controlling platforms." *The Beat* (Dec. 18): <https://www.comicsbeat.com/greg-pak-and-warren-ellis-on-newsletters-and-creators-controlling-platforms>.

[56] <https://www.kickstarter.com/projects/ronrandall/trekker-the-complete-journey-vol-ii>.

[57] <https://www.kickstarter.com/discover/categories/comics>.

[58] Alverson, Brigid. 2023. "Kickstarter Reveals Top 15 Comics Projects Of 2022: Comics Are the Category Most Likely to Succeed." *ICv2* (Feb. 2): <https://icv2.com/articles/news/view/53226/kickstarter-reveals-top-15-comics-projects-2022>.

[59] Alverson, Brigid. 2023. "Kickstarter Comics Campaigns Are Up In The First Half Of 2023; $17.6 Million Pledged So Far This Year." *ICv2* (July 19): <https://icv2.com/articles/news/view/54628/kickstarter-comics-campaigns-are-up-first-half-2023>.

[60] Alverson, Brigid. 2023. "First Trade Of 'The Expanse: Dragon Tooth' To Ship In December To Retailers and Backers of $1.4 Million Kickstarter Campaign." *ICv2* (July 27): <https://icv2.com/articles/news/view/54712/first-trade-the-expanse-dragon-tooth-ship-december>.

[61] As this article had been turned in for editing, an article with similar methodology for traditional comic books appeared, and can be freely read

online. See Hansen, Kelli. 2023. "The Scarcity of Comic Books in American Research Libraries." In *Comic Books, Special Collections, and the Academic Library*, online at https://mospace.umsystem.edu/xmlui/bitstream/handle/10355/97165/TheScarcityOfComicBooksInAmericanResearchLibraries.pdf>.

[62] "We have dozens of Kickstarter books in the collection! Finding only 3 is more a function of the cataloging than anything else. …. On Kickstarter alone, I've backed 337 projects, and I'd say that over 300 of them are going to be comics. (email communication July 5, 2023).

[63] Murray, Matthew, and Mara Thacker. "What About Crowdfunded Comics?" In *Comic Books, Special Collections, and the Academic Library*, edited by Brian Flota and Kate Morris. Chicago: Association of College & Research Libraries, forthcoming and Thacker, Mara L. and Jason Larsen. 2023. "Stretch Goals: Launching Crowdfunded Comics Collections In Academic Libraries." *Art Libraries Journal* 48 (3, July): 69-73. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1017/alj.2023.12>.

[64] "Stretch Goals," op.cit, p. 72.

[65] McGurk, Caitlin and Jenny E. Robb. 2019. "Comics in Special Collections: Purposeful Collection Development for Promoting Inclusive History," in *Comics and Critical Librarianship: Reframing the Narrative in Academic Libraries*, Library Juice Press, pps. 161-181. online at <https://kb.osu.edu/bitstream/handle/1811/91584/1/McGurkC_RobbJE_2019_chapter.pdf>. The whole article is worth reading, but for our purposes, be sure to note pages 168-169 on 'Born-digital materials and Crowdfunding.' At the other end of the spectrum, this paper looks at Association of Research Libraries members comics holdings based on Eisner and Harvey Award winners. Wagner, Cassie. 2010. "Graphic Novel Collections in Academic ARL Libraries." [final draft version]. *OpenSIUC* (January): <https://opensiuc.lib.siu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?referer=&httpsredir=1&article=1048&context=morris_articles>.

[66] <ttps://www.worldcat.org/search?q=kw%3Apatreon+AND+kw%3Acomic>.

[67] <https://zoop.gg>.

[68] <https://ijoca.blogspot.com/p/crowdfunded-comics-search-in-worldcat.html>.

[69] "BackerKit Opens Doors To All Creators," press release email, July 19, 2023. Zoop's Eric Moss responded to an email query about post-funding campaign availability of their products by writing directly to me, "if the books haven't gone to print yet, we can fit in last-minute orders. And if they have gone to print, there's a chance they'll be included in our e-commerce storefront that we'll be launching soon." October 13, 2023.

[70] "A Cataloging in Publication record (aka CIP data) is a bibliographic record prepared by the Library of Congress for a book that has not yet been published. When the book is published, the publisher includes the CIP data on the copyright page thereby facilitating book processing for libraries and

book dealers." <https://www.loc.gov/programs/cataloging-in-publication/about-this-program>.

[71] Salkowitz, Rob. 2021. "Crowdfunding a Publishing House: PW Talks with Spike Trotman." *Publishers Weekly* (October 20): <https://www.publishersweekly.com/pw/by-topic/industry-news/comics/article/87671-crowdfunding-a-publishing-house-pw-talks-with-spike-trotman.html>.

[72] Johnston, Rich. 2023. "Sebastian Girner's New Crowdfund Comics Publisher, Goats Flying Press." *Bleeding Cool* (Sept. 19): <https://bleedingcool.com/comics/sebastian-girner-new-crowdfund-comics-publisher-goats-flying-press>.

[73] Successful searches were Kickstarter+series - <https://www.comics.org/searchNew/?q=kickstarter&selected_facets=facet_model_name_exact:series>; Indiegogo+issue - <https://www.comics.org/searchNew/?q=indiegogo&selected_facets=facet_model_name_exact:issue>; Patreon+issue - <https://www.comics.org/searchNew/?q=Patreon&selected_facets=facet_model_name_exact:issue>.

[74] Use the second tab at the bottom of the spreadsheet at <https://ijoca.blogspot.com/p/crowdfunded-comics-search-in-worldcat.html>.

[75] <https://www.comics.org/searchNew/?q=indiegogo&selected_facets=facet_model_name_exact:issue>.

[76] <https://www.comics.org/issue/2065325>.

[77] <https://www.comics.org/issue/2233394>.

[78] <https://www.comics.org/searchNew/?q=Patreon&selected_facets=facet_model_name_exact:issue>.

[79] "Crowdfunders: Submit Your Comics to the Guide," *Scoop* (Jan. 12, 2024): <https://scoop.previewsworld.com/Home/4/1/73/1012?ArticleID=272368>. The information requested with the physical copy is:

- Minimum level to get the issue (this is in lieu of cover price in most cases).
- Description of the story.
- Creator(s) and cover artist(s) who contributed to the issue.
- If multiple covers were offered, please note which ones are Cover A, B, C, etc.
- If not clear in your indicia, include title, publication date, and publisher/company name.

[80] Thacker, Mara L. and Jason Larsen. 2023. "Stretch Goals: Launching Crowdfunded Comics Collections In Academic Libraries." *Art Libraries Journal*. 48 (3, July): 69-73. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1017/alj.2023.12>.

[81] See <https://www.kickstarter.com/projects/1995040525/fuzzbuquet-3-witches-warriors-and-wedgies for an example>.

[82] For basic information, see <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Charles_Evans_(librarian)#American_Bibliography>.

Patreon, Substack, and Other Email Lists (NB every Kickstarter campaign has its own newsletter)

3 Worlds / 3 Moons (3W3M)	https://3w3m.substack.com/	paid
Jason Aaron's Beard Missives	https://jasonaaron.substack.com/	free
AIPT	https://www.patreon.com/aiptcomics	paid
Von Allan	https://us14.campaign-archive.com/home/?u=f6d06612e90503db886a31a24&id=7642c19478	free
Troy-Jeffrey Allen	https://rexco-comics.us1.list-manage.com/subscribe?u=52a388c6162c699c0bb72ca56&id=b97f343cfd	free
Andrews McMeel Kids	https://www.ampkids.com/	free
Anime News Network	https://www.animenewsnetwork.com/newsletter	free
Archie Comics Shop	https://us3.campaign-archive.com/home/?u=88f30d5be2193ba061e256112&id=6f28a5722f	free
Ashcan Press Comics Corporation	https://ashcanpress.substack.com/	paid
Autobiographix	https://autobiographix.substack.com/	free
AWA Studios	https://us20.campaign-archive.com/home/?u=32f6c49c89da2819f220846f1&id=8ad00ba973	free
BAD		
Baltimore Comic-Con		free
Rodney Barnes from Dark Apocrypha Presents	https://rodneybarnes.substack.com/	paid
Lucy Bellwood	https://buttondown.email/lucybellwood/archive/	free
Brian Michael Bendis from JINXWORLD	https://brianmichaelbendis.substack.com/	paid
Vanessa Bettencourt	https://www.thevioletwest.com/	free
Beyond Comics store		free
Big Planet Comics store		free
Black Eye Books	https://www.blackeye.ca/	free
Bleeding Cool Lying in the Gutters Daily	https://us2.campaign-archive.com/home/?u=6ac192ccec40f9e5cd7cf4c3c&id=0d50dc8fdf	free
Book Riot Comics	https://bookriot.com/newsletters/	free
Books with Pictures store	https://bookswithpictures.com/	free
From the Desk of Ed Brubaker	https://us13.campaign-archive.com/home/?u=12703963b24c2d94a368d4082&id=ffaede124d	free
Tom Brevoort from Man With A Hat	https://tombrevoort.substack.com/	free
Steve Brodner from The Greater Quiet	https://stevebrodner.substack.com/	paid
William L Brown from Native Cpeaker	https://nativecpeaker.substack.com/	free
Caglecast	https://caglecast.com/	free
Hilary Fitzgerald Campbell from Cartoons by Hilary	https://cartoonsbyhilary.substack.com/	paid

Sophie Campbell from BARF	https://sophiecampbell.substack.com/	paid
Cartoonists Rights Network International	https://cartoonistsrights.org/	paid
CartoonStock	https://cartooncollections.activehosted.com/index.php/	free
Scott Cederlund's From Cover to Cover	https://www.fromcovertocover.com/	free
Center for Cartoon Studies	https://visitor.r20.constantcontact.com/manage/optin?v=001-C0KnEtb87dPgt2cxLQtg2bpWnvYUT17dxGRKkQbgf2PWas2JMQgZTQWDdKW-YrOdIAGoif5Ip5XA5Ez7M90Fi5KhxndPRl6OdmAflJpXNk%3D	free
Charles M. Schulz Museum	https://schulzmuseum.us13.list-manage.com/subscribe?u=43d9a5b34c262b0dcb1491957&id=f0823848f2	free
Elsa Charretier & PK Colinet	https://www.patreon.com/elsacharretier/posts/	paid
Howard Chaykin...as ever, I remain...	https://howardchaykin.substack.com/	free
Ryan Claytor's Elephant Eater Comics	www.patreon.com/ryanclaytor/	paid
The Delilah Dirk Newsletter by Tony Cliff	https://tinyletter.com/delilahdirk/	free
Clover Press' Newsletter	https://cloverpress.us/pages/contact/	free
Comic Art Europe		
The Comics Beat	https://www.patreon.com/comicsbeat/posts	paid
Steve Conley	https://www.patreon.com/steveconley/posts	paid
Steve Cook from Secret Oranges	https://secretoranges.substack.com/	paid
Paul Cornell's Friday Newsletter	https://paulcornell.substack.com/	paid
Danielle Corsetto	https://www.patreon.com/dcorsetto/posts/	paid
Counterpoint	https://counterpoint.substack.com/	paid
JD Crowe	https://link.al.com/join/6fp/signup/	free
The Daily Cartoonist	https://www.dailycartoonist.com/index.php/subscribe-to-the-daily-cartoonist/	free
Dark Horse Comics	https://digital.darkhorse.com/getresponse/manage/	free
Den Of Geek	https://www.denofgeek.com/newsletter/	free
Tony DePaul's The Nickels of the Man	https://www.tonydepaul.net/	free
Diamond Books		
Liza Donnelly from Seeing Things	https://lizadonnelly.substack.com/	paid
Rich Douek from Just Douek	https://richdouek.substack.com/	free
Drawn & Quarterly D+Q DISPATCH	https://drawnandquarterly.us12.list-manage.com/subscribe?u=3a88ccefd5b77631d0c60cb20&id=47a982d26d	free
Dren Productions	https://drenproductions.substack.com/	paid
Gerry Duggan	https://gerryduggan.substack.com/	paid
Bob Eckstein from The Bob	https://thebob.substack.com/	paid
Warren Ellis' Orbital Operations	https://orbitaloperations.beehiiv.com/	free
The Fanatic by PW	https://www.publishersweekly.com/pw/email-subscriptions/index.html/	free

Fantagraphics	https://us11.campaign-archive.com/home/?u=e7bf7e04ba74544c5173d3076&id=35a5a5049c	free
Fantom Comics store	https://stores.comichub.com/fantom_comics/	free
Mark Fiore	https://markfiore.substack.com/	paid
David Fitzsimmons	https://davidwfitzsimmons.substack.com/	free
Flying Eye Books / NoBrow Press	https://us4.campaign-archive.com/home/?u=81b914151c8ead9f110b42ce0&id=1d2976c124	free
Lordess Foudre's 404Ever	https://404ever.substack.com	free
Khary Randolph and Joanne Starer from Glass Eye Studios	https://glasseyestudios.substack.com/	paid
Dan Goldman @ Dang Old Man	https://dangoldman.substack.com/	free
Goodwyn Cartoons	http://xp4zn.mjt.lu/nl3/XjQfVcTIjoGDHdNOAQLCZA	free
Graphic Medicine	https://us19.campaign-archive.com/?e=e9e0273889&u=41319bb11b24786d940d99d6e&id=53056910a6	free
Dean Haspiel's Newsletter	https://deanhaspiel.substack.com/	free
Ben Hatke	https://www.patreon.com/benhatke/posts/	paid
Ray-Anthony Height from Studio SKYE-TIGER	https://www.studioskyetiger.com/	paid
Hermes Press	http://www.hermespress.com/	free
Tini Howard's The Scorpio Room	https://tinihoward.substack.com/	paid
Outlined By Chaz Hutton	https://chazhutton.substack.com/	
ICv2	https://icv2.com/	free
Image Comics	https://imagecomics.us3.list-manage.com/subscribe?u=23ff117928e9c67d4b80d4493&id=3d75263f54	free
Studio Jantze	https://www.patreon.com/jantze	paid
Dave Kellett: SHELDON!	https://www.patreon.com/sheldoncomics/posts	paid
Kid Beowulf Comics	https://us9.campaign-archive.com/home/?u=f12893aa3c7a95651850b0947&id=ce227de008	free
Matt Kindt's Flux House	https://www.patreon.com/FluxHouse	paid
KLC Press	https://klcpress.substack.com/	paid
Keith Knight	https://keithknight.substack.com/	paid
Maia Kobabe	https://www.patreon.com/maiakobabe	paid
Josh Kramer Newsletter	https://joshkramer.substack.com/	free
Laughing Redhead Comics--Teresa Logan	https://www.patreon.com/LaughingRedhead/posts	paid
Jeff Lemire from Tales From the Farm	https://jefflemire.substack.com/	paid
Library Comic Newsletter	https://buttondown.email/LibraryComic	free
Ligne Claire (French)	https://www.ligneclaire.info/	free
André Lima Araújo's Castrum Lusitania	https://andrelimaaraujo.substack.com/	free/paid
Dana Jeri Maier from Skipping to the Fun Parts	https://danajeri.substack.com/	free
Matt Madden	https://mattmadden.com/contact/	free
MSX--The Mangasplaining	https://mangasplaining.substack.com/	paid

Extra Newsletter		
José Marzán, Jr's Digital India Ink	https://josemarzan.substack.com/	paid
Maverick	https://madcavestudios.com/maverick/maverick-news/	free
Milkfed Dispatches by DeConnick & Fraction	https://milkfeddispatches.substack.com/	free
Mark Millar	https://us7.campaign-archive.com/home/?u=ebcd2cef437d72412e1b93304&id=9aaf3d6bab	free
Pat Mills Iconoblast Erica Moen	https://iconoblast.substack.com/	paid
Fábio Moon from Fábio's Moon Base	https://fabiomoon.substack.com/	free
Grant Morrison's Xanaduum	https://grantmorrison.substack.com/	paid
Mutts	https://mutts.com/	free
Nation's OppArt Weekly	https://www.thenation.com/sailthruform/oppart_weekly/	free
Newsarama	newsletter@emails.newsarama.com/	free
The Nib	https://thenib.com/	paid
Ocean Ale House by Neil Ballard	https://us19.campaign-archive.com/home/?u=3ab33f9581d5b805145133eb7&id=e2bc943bfc	free
Oni Press public relations newsletter		
Joe Quesada's Drawing the Line Somewhere	https://joequesada.substack.com/	free
Greg Pak	https://gregpak.com/newsletter/	free
Paperfilms (Jimmy Palmiotti and Amanda Connor)	https://us14.campaign-archive.com/home/?u=743d2f07216aa34571f30ca3e&id=a08072557c	free
Andrew Pepoy Comics	https://us17.campaign-archive.com/home/?u=b6ad11aa90a88fe9c6b2a8c7b&id=adb378cffe	free
Tom Richmond's Ink Stained Wretch	https://tomrichmond.us17.list-manage.com/subscribe/	free
Rafer Roberts	https://www.patreon.com/rafercomics/posts/	paid
Rocketship Entertainment	https://us7.campaign-archive.com/home/?u=8f15369c27f8d8324e3680aee&id=735ecba352	free
Rosarium Publishing	http://rosariumpublishing.com/	free
Art of P. Craig Russell	https://www.artofpcraigrussell.com/	paid
Brandon Schatz from The Indirect Market	https://theindirectmarket.substack.com/	free
Erica Schultz Writes	https://us14.campaign-archive.com/home/?u=f142770b6cc89ff4de2809be2&id=3df9be7178	free
Chris Schweizer	https://www.patreon.com/ChrisSchweizer/	paid
Cavan Scott from The Cavletter	https://cavanscott.substack.com/	paid
Alex Segura	https://alexsegura.substack.com/	free
Declan Shalvey from Declarations	https://declanshalvey.substack.com/	free
Bill Sienkiewicz	https://billsienkiewiczart.com/pages/about	free
Sire Studios	https://sirestudiosinc.com/subscribe/	free

John Siuntres & The Word Balloon Podcast	https://www.patreon.com/wordballoon/posts/	paid
Small Press Expo	https://www.smallpressexpo.com/spx-newsletter/	free
Grant Snider from Incidental Comics	https://incidentalcomics.substack.com/	free
Solrad	https://solrad.co/	free
Jen Sorensen	https://jensorensen.com/subscribe/	paid
Charles Soule	https://mailchi.mp/f0a5b413051c/charlessoule	free
Spaghetti Kiss	https://spaghettikiss.myshopify.com/	free
Karl Stevens	https://www.patreon.com/PennyComic666	paid
ND Stevenson	https://www.imfineimfine.com/	free?
Ann Telnaes from Open Windows	https://anntelnaes.substack.com/	free
Third Eye Comics store	info@thirdeyecomics.com/	free
Kelly Thompson's 1979 Semi-Finalist	https://1979semifinalist.substack.com/	paid
Tom the Dancing Bug	https://www.patreon.com/rubenbolling/	paid
Tom Tomorrow's Sparky's List	https://manage.campaignzee.com/l2UvkJdcSc/	paid
Top Shelf	https://topshelfproductionsinc.forwardtomyfriend.com/y-jutltysu-E8946B19-pditrdk-l-r	free
TwoMorrows	https://groups.io/g/twomorrows/	free
James Tynion IV's The Empire of the Tiny Onion	https://jamestynioniv.substack.com/	paid
Vault Comics	https://vaultcomics.com/	free
Andi Watson	https://www.patreon.com/andiwatson/posts/	paid
Joshua Williamson's Super Scary Newsletter	https://joshuawilliamson.substack.com/	paid
YouNeek Studios	info@youneekstudios.com/	free
xkcd comic	https://xkcd.com/newsletter/	free
Chip Zdarsky	https://zdarsky.substack.com/	paid
Zoop	https://zoop.us2.list-manage.com/subscribe?u=4f82b2327c07557c6d14e032b&id=0471539782	free

Academic Journals on Comics (Summer 2023)

• *animation*

animation: an interdisciplinary journal provides the first cohesive international peer-reviewed publishing platform for animation that unites contributions from a wide range of research agendas and creative practice. The journal's scope is very comprehensive, yet its focus is clear and simple. The journal addresses all animation made using all known (and yet to be developed) techniques--from 16th Century optical devices to contemporary digital media--revealing its implications on other forms of time-based media expression past, present, and future. *animation: an interdisciplinary journal* is essential and stimulating reading for academics, researchers, students, curators, and practitioners in animation, film, and media studies, cultural

studies, critical theory, architecture, art and design, computer sciences, games studies, and visual culture.

• Closure. Kieler e-Journal fur Comicforschung
Die wissenschaftliche Auseinandersetzung mit Comics ist in Deutschland noch nicht institutionalisiert. Ihre Terminologie ist im Entstehen und viele methodische und theoretische Fragestellungen noch offen - die Comicforschung ist jung. Deshalb haben wir uns mit CLOSURE ganz bewusst dazu entschlossen, im Sinne der Nachwuchsforderung innovative Ansatze und relevante Forschungsergebnisse von Studierenden, Doktorand_innen, Habilitand_innen und Professor_innen gleichermaßen zu publizieren. Diese Bandbreite spiegelt sich auch im Redaktionsteam von CLOSURE wider: Wissenschaftler_innen unterschiedlicher Erfahrungsstufen haben sich zusammengefunden, um zu der Vernetzung und Etablierung der deutschsprachigen Comicforschung beizutragen. [Google translation: The scientific examination of comics is not yet institutionalized in Germany. Their terminology is still in the making and many methodological and theoretical questions are still open--comics research is young. That is why we made a conscious decision with CLOSURE to publish innovative approaches and relevant research results from students, doctoral candidates, post-doctoral candidates. and professors alike in the interest of promoting young researchers. This range is also reflected in the editorial team of CLOSURE: Scientists with different levels of experience have come together to contribute to the networking and establishment of German-language comic research.]

• *Comicalités*
Comicalités. *Studies in Graphic Culture* inquires into the specificities and transformations of the ways in which comics have been produced and read. The journal welcomes a diversity of analyses and approaches and promotes multidisciplinary perspectives on comics, their contradictions, and complexities. Articles and special issues, carefully peer-reviewed, are published on a continuous basis. ISSN 2117-4911.

• *Comics Grid*
Founded in 2010, *The Comics Grid: Journal of Comics Scholarship* is an open-access, researcher-led, peer-reviewed academic journal. The journal aims to publish original and specialized contributions to the field of comics scholarship from multidisciplinary and media-specific perspectives. The journal aims to promote innovative comics scholarship where the writing is energetic and theoretically and interpretively bold, and that presents specialized knowledge in accessible and engaging forms. It also considers submissions that explore the ways in which comics can be used for scholarly purposes.

• *CuCo*, *Cuadernos de cómic*
La revista *CuCo, Cuadernos de cómic* fue fundada en 2013 con el objetivo de ser una plataforma de publicación para investigadores que estudian el cómic desde cualquier perspectiva y ámbito del conocimiento. Desde sus orígenes, ha mantenido una política de gratuidad y acceso abierto con el fin de fomentar los avances en la investigación en torno al cómic y ayudar a construir su conocimiento. *CuCo, Cuadernos de cómic*, por ello, no cobra ningún tipo de tasa por publicación a los contribuidores. [Google translation: The magazine *CuCo, Cuadernos de cómic* was founded in 2013 with the aim of being a publication platform for researchers who study comics from any perspective and field of knowledge. Since its origins, it has maintained a policy of free and open access in order to promote advances in research on comics and help build their knowledge. *CuCo, Cuadernos de cómic*, therefore, does not charge contributors any type of publication rate.]

• *Deutsche Comicforschung*
Die seit 2005 jährlich fortgeführte Reihe *Deutsche Comicforschung* ist das Standardwerk zur Erforschung der nationalen Comicgeschichte. Wissenschaftlich akribisch und trotzdem lesbar, angereichert mit Hunderten von zumeist farbigen Abbildungen, bietet jeder Band einen Fundus von bisher unbekannten Beispielen deutschsprachiger Comics aller Epochen. [Google translation: The *German Comic Research* series, which has been continued annually since 2005, is the standard work for research into national comic history. Scientifically meticulous and yet readable, enriched with hundreds of mostly color illustrations, each volume offers a pool of previously unknown examples of German-language comics from all eras.]

• *European Comic Art*
European Comic Art is the first English-language scholarly publication devoted to the study of European-language graphic novels, comic strips, comic books, and caricature.

• *Image & Narrative*
Image & Narrative is a peer-reviewed e-journal on visual narratology and word and image studies in the broadest sense of the term. It does not focus on a narrowly defined corpus or theoretical framework, but questions the mutual shaping of literary and visual cultures.

• *ImageTexT: Interdisciplinary Comics Studies*
ImageTexT is a peer-reviewed, open access journal dedicated to the interdisciplinary study of comics and related media.

• *Inks*

Inks, the journal of the Comics Studies Society, features scholarly research on sequential art, graphic narrative, and cartooning. The journal seeks to bring together scholarly essays, archival materials, and insights and discoveries from leading comics professionals. *Inks* highlights scholarship from a variety of disciplines and invites essays on all periods of comic history, as well as considering both a U.S. or an international comics focus.

• *International Journal of Comic Art*
International and multidisciplinary in scope, *IJOCA* aims to publish scholarly and readable research on any aspect of comic art, defined as animation, comic books, newspaper and magazine strips, caricature, gag and political cartoons, humorous art, and humor or cartoon magazines. It is the oldest, continuously published comics journal, celebrating 25 years in 2023. Encyclopedic in content, *IJOCA* published 1,460 articles, many by top scholars, during that span.

• *Journal of Anime and Manga Studies*
The *Journal of Anime and Manga Studies* (JAMS) is an open-access journal dedicated to providing an ethical, peer-reviewed space for academics, students, and independent researchers examining the field of anime, manga, cosplay, and fandom studies to share their research with others. *JAMS* is peer reviewed by scholars with experience in these areas. The goal of *JAMS* is to explore anime as an art form and bring visibility to the deeper meanings, understandings, and/or cultural significance of anime, manga, cosplay, and their fandoms. The use of "anime" as a descriptor in all principles includes manga, cosplay, and its fandoms.

• *Journal of Graphic Novels and Comics*
The *Journal of Graphic Novels and Comics* is a peer reviewed journal covering all aspects of the graphic novel, comic strip, and comic book, with the emphasis on comics in their cultural, institutional, and creative contexts. Its scope is international, covering not only English language comics, but also worldwide comic culture. The journal reflects interdisciplinary research in comics and aims to establish a dialogue between academics, historians, theoreticians, and practitioners of comics.

• *Mechademia: Second Arc*
A groundbreaking exploration of anime, manga, and Japanese popular culture. *Mechademia: Second Arc* is a biannual journal series designed to promote academic and professional discourse around East Asian popular cultures. Its scope includes professional and fan-created works influenced by the forms of anime, Japanese manga/Korean manhwa/Chinese manhua, cinema, television dramas, digital media, video gaming, music, performance

arts, and many other forms of popular culture that have proliferated in East Asia and throughout the world. This journal promotes high-quality academic research on anime, manga, and related pop cultural fields, in making key articles by East Asian authors accessible to English-speaking readers through original translations, and in promoting cultural exchange between artists, authors, fans, and scholars from various contexts, both through the journal and through related conferences held annually in the United States and biennially in Asia. Submissions to the series are required to be written in "open" language rather than adopting the exclusive language of academic discourse, but without detracting from a high level of inquiry.

• *Neuróptica*
Neuróptica. *Estudios sobre el cómic* se constituye como una publicación que toma al cómic como objeto central de estudio, desde una perspectiva totalmente multidisciplinar, a través de cualquier campo de estudio y ámbito del conocimiento. [Google translation: *Neuroptics*. *Estudios sobre el cómic* is constituted as a publication that takes comics as a central object of study, from a totally multidisciplinary perspective, through any field of study and field of knowledge.]

• *neuvième art 2.0*
Le journal de la cité de la bd.

• *Nona Arte (aka 9a)*
Divulgar artigos científicos inéditos sobre histórias em quadrinhos, resultantes de pesquisas acadêmicas desenvolvidas por pesquisadores do Brasil e do exterior. Garantir espaço para depoimentos e entrevistas de personalidades significativas para o desenvolvimento das histórias em quadrinhos no Brasil, bem como a resenhas sobre publicações de caráter científico sobre quadrinhos publicadas no Brasil ou no exterior. Registrar o panorama de atividades (trabalhos acadêmicos, exposições, eventos, etc.) sobre histórias em quadrinhos desenvolvidas no país. [Google translation: Disseminate unpublished scientific articles on comics, resulting from academic research carried out by researchers from Brazil and abroad. Ensure space for testimonials and interviews of significant personalities for the development of comics in Brazil, as well as reviews on scientific publications on comics published in Brazil or abroad. Register the panorama of activities (academic works, exhibitions, events, etc.) about comics developed in the country.]

• *SANE Journal: Sequential Art Narrative in Education*
SANE journal publishes peer-reviewed articles from researchers and practitioners from a variety of disciplines seeking to add significantly to the global knowledge associated with all aspects of graphica (comics, graphic

novels, and its related forms) and education.

• *Scandinavian Journal of Comic Art* (SJoCA)
Scandinavian Journal of Comic Art (SJoCA) is an online, open-access, peer reviewed academic journal about comics and sequential art. The scope of the journal is interdisciplinary, encouraging a wide range of theoretical and methodological perspectives. The journal publishes articles, book reviews, and news from the field of comics studies. The language of the journal is English. Although the journal is rooted in the Nordic countries (Denmark, Finland, Iceland, Norway, and Sweden), it is global in scope and aims to publish high quality research regardless of national or regional boundaries. [NB: may be defunct--see <https://web.archive.org/web/20190622112343/http://www.sjoca.com/ for content>.]

• *SIGNs--Studies in Graphic Narratives*
SIGNs--Studies in Graphic Narratives--is a new, peer-reviewed journal focusing on comics (or, in contemporary jargon, graphic novels), from modern times up to the early decades of the 20th Century. Why a new journal? We have been living a steeply growing interest in comics since the 1990s, with the medium gaining large acceptance as an art form and a significant part of popular culture, as well as an investigation subject in social studies. This interest and intellectual appraisal has extended to the rich history of comics and related forms as well. However, hitherto the (still scarce) current scientific research tends to focus on post-1930s publications, and early comics remain largely unexplored. *SIGNs* aims at bridging this gap. Notwithstanding impressive field work by pioneers like David Kunzle in his two volumes of *The History of the Comic Strip*, the medium still suffers from a somewhat meager historiographic 'legacy'.

• *Studies in Comics*
Studies in Comics aims to describe the nature of comics, to identify the medium as a distinct art form, and to address the medium's formal properties. The emerging field of comics studies is a model for interdisciplinary research, and, in this spirit this journal, welcomes all approaches. This journal is international in scope and provides an inclusive space in which researchers from all backgrounds can present new thinking on comics to a global audience.

Popular Culture Journals

• *Belphégor*
Belphégor is an international refereed scholarly journal dedicated to the

study of popular literature and media culture. The journal welcomes all types of theoretical analysis and encourages interdisciplinarity and comparative studies. Our goal is to stimulate discussion, research, and exchange between researchers of all stripes in the Anglo-saxon, French, Italian, German, Spanish, and Portuguese-speaking worlds.

• *Journal of Popular Culture*
The *Journal of Popular Culture* continues to break down the barriers between so-called "low" and "high" culture and focuses on filling in the gaps that a neglect of popular culture has left in our understanding of the workings of society.

Michael Rhode, an assistant editor of *International Journal of Comic Art*, has been associated with *IJOCA* since its beginning, serving as exhibitions and media reviews editor, developing, and handling the *IJOCA* blog, managing the forthcoming index, and converting all past issues to digital version. He has been a foremost comics bibliographer for decades and publishes his online *ComicsDC*.